



Comparing Religious Moderation Strategies: P5 vs. P5-PPRA in Elementary Schools

Noptario^{1✉}, Sulfiani², Mohammad Yusuf Randy³, Alia Latifah⁴, Syamela Massa Kaulika⁵, ABD Razak Zakaria⁶

^{1, 2, 4, 5}Faculty of education and teacher training, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

³Faculty of Education, State University of Malang, Indonesia,

⁶Faculty of Education, University of Malaya, Malaysia

ABSTRACT

Indonesia, as a multicultural nation with diverse cultures, ethnicities, races, and religions, emphasizes the importance of tolerance and mutual respect among its people to prevent conflicts. One approach to achieving this is by enhancing religious moderation values. In the context of elementary schools and madrasah ibtidaiyah, the Pancasila Education (P5) and Pancasila and Religious Education (P5-PPRA) programs play a central role. The aim of this study is to compare the effectiveness of the P5 and P5-PPRA programs in improving religious moderation. This study employs a quantitative approach with data collection through questionnaires. Respondents consisted of 100 students and 8 teachers at Kanisius and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah during the 2023/2024 academic year. The data were validated and analyzed using the Paired Sample T-test. The analysis results showed a significant value (2-tailed) of $0.000 < 0.05$, indicating a significant relationship between P5 (at Elementary Schools) and PPRA (in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah) in enhancing religious moderation. The average score of P5 is 74.30, while P5-PPRA is 87.20, with an average difference of 12.91. This indicates that the P5-PPRA program is more effective in strengthening religious moderation in schools. This finding suggests that students at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah exhibit higher tolerance and appreciation for diversity compared to students at Kanisius schools. These findings can be utilized by policymakers and educators to improve religious moderation programs by adopting and integrating P5-PPRA elements, thereby creating a more inclusive and tolerant learning environment.

ABSTRAK

Indonesia, sebagai negara multikultural dengan beragam budaya, etnis, ras, dan agama, meniscayakan toleransi dan saling menghormati di antara masyarakatnya untuk mencegah konflik. Salah satu pendekatan untuk mencapai hal ini adalah dengan meningkatkan nilai-nilai moderasi beragama termasuk di sekolah dasar dan madrasah ibtidaiyah, melalui program Pendidikan Pancasila (P5) dan Pendidikan Pancasila dan Agama (P5-PPRA) memainkan peran sentral. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk membandingkan efektivitas program P5 dan P5-PPRA dalam meningkatkan moderasi beragama. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kuantitatif dengan pengumpulan data melalui kuesioner. Responden terdiri dari 100 siswa dan 8 guru di Kanisius dan Madrasah Ibtidaiyah selama tahun ajaran 2023/2024. Data divalidasi dan dianalisis menggunakan Uji T Sampel Berpasangan. Hasil analisis menunjukkan nilai signifikan (2-tailed) sebesar $0.000 < 0.05$, yang menunjukkan hubungan signifikan antara P5 (Sekolah

 OPEN ACCESS

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: 21-06-2024

Accepted: 30-08-2024

KEYWORDS

religious moderation,
elementary schools
P5, P5PPRA

KATA KUNCI:

Moderasi Beragama,
P5, P5PPRA, sekolah
dasar

Corresponding E-mail: ✉noptario7@gmail.com,

Dasar) dan PPRA (Madrasah Ibtidaiyah) dalam meningkatkan moderasi beragama. Skor rata-rata P5 adalah 74.30, sedangkan P5-PPRA adalah 87.20, dengan perbedaan rata-rata sebesar 12.91. Ini menunjukkan bahwa program P5-PPRA lebih efektif dalam memperkuat moderasi beragama di sekolah. Temuan ini menunjukkan bahwa siswa di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah menunjukkan toleransi dan apresiasi yang lebih tinggi terhadap keberagaman dibandingkan dengan siswa di Kanisius. Temuan ini dapat dimanfaatkan oleh pembuat kebijakan dan pendidik untuk meningkatkan program moderasi beragama dengan mengadopsi dan mengintegrasikan elemen-elemen P5-PPRA, sehingga menciptakan lingkungan belajar yang lebih inklusif dan toleran.

Introduction

Indonesia is a multicultural country with many ethnicities, cultures, races, languages, and religions (Subchi et al., 2022; Sulaiman et al., 2022). This makes Indonesia also referred to as a multireligious country because in the country of Indonesia there are six official religions that are adhered to by the people (Maarif, 2023) (Syahri et al., 2024) namely Islam, Christianity, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism (Daheri et al., 2023; Pajarianto et al., 2023). The rapid development of the times in the era of technology is a challenge for the Indonesian nation which has a heterogeneous society. Therefore, as Indonesians, we must always uphold the values of unity and integrity by respecting every culture that exists, especially in respecting every religion (Hati et al., 2023).

One of the efforts to maintain the value of unity and integrity of Indonesian religious communities is religious moderation (Hanafi et al., 2023; Widyana et al., 2022). Religious moderation can serve as a cultural strategy to keep Indonesia peaceful, tolerant and respectful. With religious moderation, every believer can coexist in harmony, mutual respect, care, and tolerance, so that conflicts caused by religious differences can be avoided (Daheri et al., 2023; Iriani et al., 2023). By strengthening religious moderation, it is hoped that religious people can place themselves appropriately in the midst of a multireligious society, so as to create social harmony and balance in community life (Indainanto et al., 2023).

Religious moderation is one of the main priorities in the 2020-2024 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) set by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (Mulyana, 2023; Rusyana et al., 2023; Yusuf et al., 2023). The existence of this religious moderation program is in order to minimize the problem of religious intolerance in Indonesia that has occurred to date (Iriani et al., 2023; Kustati et al., 2023; Pajarianto et al., 2023). Religious intolerance occurs due to several factors, such as claiming that truth exists in each religion by blaming other religions and each religion has its own values and perspectives (Harahap et al., 2023). In addition, intra-religious conflicts can also occur between various sects within the same religion (Daheri et al., 2023; Sandal, 2021) (Rahman & Noor, 2020). In 2022, there were 73 cases of religious intolerance conflicts in Indonesia, including 5 cases of refusal to religious activities, 5 cases of violence against religious people, 6 cases of destruction of places of worship, 17 cases of refusal to establish places of worship, and 32 cases of blasphemy (Iriani et al., 2023). Therefore, to minimize cases of intolerance in Indonesia, religious moderation needs to be instilled early to form a moderate future generation (Muhlisin et al., 2023).

The moderate generation is a young generation that has a balanced and not extreme understanding of religion (Helmawati et al., 2024). This generation is important for creating peace and harmony with people of different religions and cultures (Iriani et al., 2023; Pajarianto et al., 2023) (Hadriani, 2020). Therefore, the understanding of moderation in religious life in diversity needs to be instilled in the younger generation (Jati & Bachtiar, 2024), to anticipate that religious understanding does not become a support for the growth of radical ideas and intolerance (Kustati et al., 2023; Susilo & Dalimunthe, 2019). To form a moderate generation, this understanding of moderation needs to be instilled in children at elementary Kanisius schoolsge (Fadil et al., 2024) (K. Imron & Humairoh, 2023).

In Indonesia, there are two types of elementary school levels, Elementary School (SD) which falls under the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology, while Madrasah Ibtidayah (MI) which is overseen by the Ministry of Religion (Munir & Anas, 2021) (Munir & Anas, 2021). To develop graduates with a Pancasila profile, the Ministry of Education and Culture established the P5 program, while the Ministry of Religion introduced the P5-PPRA program (Pranajaya et al., 2022; Susilowati et al., 2023) (Kholis et al., 2024).

The Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project and the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project - Religious, Spiritual, and Aski Education (Akidah, Morals, and Fiqh) were created to address the moral decline in Indonesia (Pranajaya et al., 2022; Randy et al., 2023). The rapid pace of globalization has led to a decline in values, ethics (Fatmawati, 2022), and manners, which has negatively impacted cultural education and the character of the Indonesian nation (Susilowati et al., 2023; Utami et al., 2023) Therefore, the P5 and P5-PPRA programs are expected to help mitigate this moral decline, particularly in the area of religious tolerance (Dittmer, 2024).

Research by Randy and Suciptaningsih (2024) indicates that the success of internalizing religious moderation values in students can be observed through various indicators (Saefudin et al., 2023). These indicators are reflected in the routine activities and attitudes of students at the At-Tamur Street Children's Islamic Boarding School (Pajarianto et al., 2023). Intellectual humility among the younger generation is crucial for facilitating religious moderation, which includes a commitment to national values, rejection of violence, and acceptance of local cultures to promote tolerance (Wildan & Muttaqin, 2022).

Syahbudin et al. (2023) found that group counseling focused on religious moderation can enhance students' understanding of religious moderation in a societal context. Manshur & Husni (2020) demonstrated that literacy-focused learning increases students' understanding of religious moderation and fosters moderate religious attitudes and behaviors. This approach also promotes sincere ethics and builds friendships among followers of different religions (Priatmoko, 2019).

Previous studies have explored efforts to increase religious moderation at the university level to prevent intolerance and radicalism, as well as initiatives within Islamic boarding schools to combat radicalism among students. However, there has been no research specifically focusing on efforts to enhance religious moderation at the elementary school level through the P5 or P5-PPRA programs. The elementary school level is crucial for shaping children's character. There is a lack of research directly comparing the P5 program in elementary schools and the P5-PPRA program in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in the context of strengthening religious moderation. Therefore, further

research is needed to explore efforts to enhance religious moderation at the elementary school level. This study aims to compare the P5 approach in elementary schools and the P5-PPRA approach in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah to determine which is more effective in fostering religious moderation among students.

Methods

This study employs a quantitative research approach with a survey design. The survey allows researchers to draw conclusions about a population represented by respondents regarding the strengthening of religious moderation through the P5 and P5-PPRA programs in Elementary Schools and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. An individual is considered to have an attitude of religious moderation if they understand and implement four indicators: national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and respect for local culture. In this study, the researcher measured religious moderation in schools through these four indicators (Pajarianto et al., 2024).

The data collection method involves questionnaire, with respondents selected using probability sampling. Probability sampling ensures that each element of the population has an equal chance of being selected. The technique used is cluster sampling. In this sampling method, the steps include identifying the number of schools and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in Yogyakarta City. There are 39 Kanisius schools and 4 Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in Yogyakarta City. Two schools were randomly selected as research locations. The sample determination uses probability sampling at a selected location where respondents come from a predetermined group, not randomly. This study involved 108 respondents, consisting of 100 students and 8 teachers.

The research was conducted at SD Kanisius Kadirojo and MIN 1 Yogyakarta. SD Kanisius Kadirojo was chosen because it has a diverse student population, providing an opportunity to explore how religious moderation is applied in a pluralistic environment. MIN 1 Yogyakarta was selected due to its reputation as one of the leading Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in Yogyakarta City, with excellent programs in strengthening religious moderation, serving as an example of best practices in Islamic education. The selection of these schools is based on their unique characteristics, providing a rich context for religious moderation research. By examining two different locations in terms of student diversity and approaches to religious moderation, this study aims to provide a comprehensive and holistic insight into how religious moderation is promoted in primary education in Indonesia. The research was carried out in the even semester of the 2023/2024 school year.

The questionnaire instrument in this study used a Likert scale (1-5) to express the level of agreement or disagreement. The validity of the instrument was first tested by involving religious education experts who ensured that the questionnaire items covered all aspects of moderation in various ways, both in PPRA and P5-PPRA programs. The validity test results showed that the majority of items in the questionnaire had high validity, with Aiken's V values above 0.80, indicating that the instrument adequately covered the aspects intended to be measured.

Furthermore, a construct validity test was conducted using Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA), which demonstrated that the questionnaire items effectively measured the expected constructs. All items had factor loading values above 0.3, confirming that the items were valid and suitable for research purposes. The results of the construct validity test indicated that the model fit was acceptable, as evidenced by key metrics such as RMSEA (0.144) and GFI (0.976), which were within acceptable ranges. See table 1.

Table 1
Other Fit Measures Religious Moderation

Metric	Value
Root mean square error of approximation (RMSEA)	0.144
RMSEA 90% CI lower bound	0.113
RMSEA 90% CI upper bound	0.175
RMSEA p-value	6.604×10 ⁻⁶
Standardized root mean square residual (SRMR)	0.101
Hoelter's critical N ($\alpha = .05$)	31.682
Hoelter's critical N ($\alpha = .01$)	34.706
Goodness of fit index (GFI)	0.976
McDonald fit index (MFI)	0.406
Expected cross validation index (ECVI)	5.537

Table 2
Interpretasi Reliabilitas

<i>Value Cronbach's Alpha</i>	<i>Category</i>
More than or equal to 0.900	<i>Excellence (sempurna)</i>
0.800 – 0.899	<i>Good (baik)</i>
0.700 – 0.799	<i>Acceptable (diterima)</i>
0.600 – 0.699	<i>Questionable (dipertanyakan)</i>
0.500 – 0.599	<i>Poor (lemah)</i>
Less than 0.500	<i>Unacceptable (tidak diterima)</i>

Table 3
Reliability of Religious Moderation Variable X1

	Coefficient ω	Coefficient α
Religious Moderation 1	0.724	0.742
Religious Moderation 2	0.692	0.699
Religious Moderation 3	0.824	0.828
Total	0.898	0.896

Table 4
Reliability of Variable P5 Y1

	Coefficient ω	Coefficient α
P5 1	0.792	0.798
P5 2	0.797	0.794
Total	0.887	0.880

Table 5

Reliability of PPRA Variable Y2

	Coefficient ω	Coefficient α
PPRA 1	0.803	0.784
PPRA 2	0.764	0.757
PPRA 4	0.732	0.710
PPRA 3	0.717	0.747
Total	0.911	0.906

Reliability tests using Cronbach's Alpha showed that all variables in this study had alpha values greater than 0.70, indicating a good level of internal consistency among the questionnaire items. Specifically, the overall reliability for the Religious Moderation variable was 0.896, for the P5 variable was 0.880, and for the PPRA variable was 0.906, all of which reflect high reliability (Winarsunu, 2017). See table 2, 3, 4 and 5.

Data analysis in this study included classical statistical analyses such as the Normality Test, Multicollinearity Test, Descriptive Analysis, and Paired Sample T-test. Before field research was conducted, validity tests using Aiken's V, construct validity tests with CFA, and reliability tests with Cronbach's Alpha at a 5% significance level were carried out. Hypothesis testing was conducted using the Paired Sample T-test technique to determine whether there was a significant effect between the two samples. The results of the Paired Sample T-test were evaluated based on the significance value, and conclusions were drawn accordingly. This hypothesis testing was conducted using SPSS 26.0 for Windows with the Paired Sample T-test technique. The T-test results were examined in the T-test for Equality of Means column; if the Sig. (2-tailed) value is < 0.05 , then H_a is accepted, and H_0 is rejected.

The hypotheses proposed to answer the research problem in this study are:

- H_a : There is a significant difference in strengthening religious moderation between students participating in the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Program (P5) in elementary schools and students participating in the Child Friendly Education Strengthening Program (P5-PPRA) in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah.
- H_0 : There is no significant difference in strengthening religious moderation between students participating in the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Program (P5) in elementary schools and students participating in the Child Friendly Education Strengthening Program (P5-PPRA) in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah.

The basis for decision-making in this hypothesis test is:

- A significance value (2-tailed) < 0.05 proves that there are different variations in the initial and final variables, resulting in a significant effect on each variable.
- A significance value (2-tailed) > 0.05 proves that the initial and final variables do not have different variations and do not have a significant effect on each variable.

RESULT

Hypothesis Testing

Hypothesis Testing Results of P5 SD on PPRA MI with T-Test

This analysis aims to find out which religious moderation attitude is stronger between P5 in SD or P5PPRA MI. The paired sample test is used to compare the mean values of two related variables. The purpose of using this analysis is to determine statistically significant differences between paired measurements (Azahra & Kosim, 2024).

Table 6
P5 variable findings against P5PPRA
Paired Samples Statistics

	Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1 P5	74.2963	54	5.81355	.79112

P5PPRA	87.2037	54	8.57680	1.16715
--------	---------	----	---------	---------

Paired Samples Correlations

		N	Correlation	Sig.
Pair 1	P5 & P5PPRA	108	.691	.000

Paired Samples Test

		Paired Differences					t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference				
					Lower	Upper			
Pair 1	P5 - P5PPRA	-12.90741	6.19881	.84355	-14.59936	-11.21546	-15.301	53	.000

In a paired samples table 6,, the statistics of the respondents' data are presented which show that the mean value for P5 is 74.30 with 54 respondents, the standard deviation of 5.814 is the square root of the variance. This is a measure of how much the data varies from its mean, and the standard error of the mean of 0.791 is the average value obtained through a set of data calculated by summing all values and dividing by the number of data. As for P5PPRA, the mean value is 87.20 with the same number of respondents, namely 54, the standard deviation is 8.576, and the standard error of the mean of 1.167 is the average value obtained through a set of data calculated by summing all values and dividing by the amount of data. Based on the SPSS data above, it can be concluded that the results of the paired 1 test show a significance value of 0.000, which indicates that the sig value ($0.000 < 0.05$). The sig value or commonly referred to as the p value is used to determine whether the statistical test results are statistically significant or not. Using the t-test (two-tailed) at a significance level of 0.05, there is a significant mean difference between the P5 and P5PPRA programmes, with a mean difference of 12.91.

Discussion

Based on the theory of religious moderation expressed by Lukman Hakim Syaifudin, a person can be said to have an attitude of religious moderation if he implements four indicators of religious moderation, namely national commitment, non-violence, tolerance, and respect for local culture (Furqan & Nasir, 2024). These four attitudes represent someone who has a moderate spirit in the nation and state (Syaifudin, 2019).

The results of this study show that there is a relationship between the P5 program in elementary schools and the P5PPRA program in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in an effort to increase the values of religious moderation in schools. However, based on the calculation results, the P5PPRA program is superior to P5 in strengthening religious moderation. This can be explained through several factors, one of which is the madrasah environment that tends to be homogeneous, PPRa values that are more relevant to the values of religious

moderation, and the internalization of religious moderation teachings in intracurricular, co-curricular and extracurricular learning. In addition, strong religious values in the madrasah environment also contribute to better results (Noptario, 2024).

Data from this research location supports this argument. The more homogeneous environment of the madrasah allows the internalization of religious moderation values to take place more effectively. The implementation of PPRA values in madrasahs is evident in the integration of intracurricular which involves in-depth learning about religious moderation, co-curricular which includes discussion and training activities, and extracurricular which focuses on interfaith and cultural dialogue.

The findings of this study are in line with previous research by Imron (2024), who found that the focus on religious moderation values is strongly related to the madrasah environment. The study noted that values such as *tasamuh* contained in P5PPRA are specific values related to religious moderation, which are not found in the regular P5 program. However, the difference in this study lies in the methodology used, which is qualitative, with data sources from observation, interviews, and documentation, and a smaller sample size. The similarities in this study are the variables in the study (M. Imron, 2024) (Marpaung et al., 2024). Further research Syahbudin et al. (2023) showed that the application of group counseling that focuses on religious moderation can increase students' understanding of religious moderation in the context of society. The differences in this study can be seen from the analysis, data samples, and variables used. The similarity of this research with previous research is a quantitative approach and data collection using a questionnaire. Previous research by (Manshur & Husni, 2020) also supports these results, showing that literacy-focused learning is successful in improving students' understanding of the importance of religious moderation, as well as developing religiously moderate attitudes and behaviors. This approach also creates sincere ethics and builds friendship among people of different religions. The difference between this study lies in the hypothesis, the number of research samples, and the source of research data, while the similarity is the use of quantitative methods and questionnaires for data collection.

From these results, it can be concluded that the cultivation of religious moderation values can be realized through co-curricular activities, learning integration, and extracurricular activities with a focus on the values of nationalism, diversity, and tolerance. A school environment that supports the values of religious moderation has a significant impact on fostering religious moderation in students. The implication in education is the importance of developing character education and tolerance, creating a harmonious social environment, and encouraging collaboration between parents and the community. The development of religious moderation in educational institutions not only strengthens national values and unity, but also prepares students to become responsible citizens and contribute positively in a diverse society.

Conclusion

Pancasila Education (P5) and Pancasila Education and Religious Education (P5-PPRA) play a crucial role in strengthening religious moderation in primary schools and madrasah ibtidaiyah. Both programs aim to enhance students' understanding of religious

values and Pancasila, and to foster their awareness of religious tolerance amidst diverse beliefs. The results indicate that P5 at the primary school level and P5-PPRA at the madrasah ibtidaiyah level significantly enhance religious moderation in the school environment. T-test analysis revealed a significance value (2-tailed) of 0.000, indicating a significant relationship between the strengthening of religious moderation values and both programs. The average score for P5 was 74.30, while P5-PPRA scored 87.20, with an average difference of 12.91. Thus, the P5-PPRA program proved to be more effective in strengthening religious moderation in schools compared to the P5 program.

These findings align with Imron's 2024 research, which revealed that the madrasah environment and P5-PPRA values strengthen religious moderation more effectively than the elementary school environment and P5 dimensions. Additionally, the values embedded in P5-PPRA align more closely with religious moderation values than those in P5, contributing to the greater effectiveness of P5-PPRA in fostering religious moderation in schools.

This study recommends that elementary schools using the P5 program consider optimizing the strengthening of religious moderation through other programs focused on internalizing the four indicators of religious moderation. Examples include monthly studies, integrating religious moderation into each subject, and extracurricular activities. These efforts can help achieve maximum results in strengthening students' religious moderation. Furthermore, it is necessary to evaluate policies within elementary schools, particularly the P5 program, to enhance religious moderation, given the importance of students' understanding of religious moderation.

The limitations of this study include its limited scope, as it was conducted in only two schools in Yogyakarta. Additionally, this study highlights efforts to strengthen religious moderation in the P5 and P5-PPRA programs without delving deeply into all school programs related to religious moderation. It also focuses on comparing the P5 and P5-PPRA programs without exploring their long-term impacts. This research serves as a foundational reference for future researchers, emphasizing the need for efforts to strengthen religious moderation specifically in elementary schools, particularly within the P5 program. Future research should consider more in-depth variables related to religious moderation in the context of the P5 and P5-PPRA programs. It is hoped that this research will contribute new knowledge and useful literature for understanding the implementation of programs at the primary school/madrasah ibtidaiyah level to strengthen religious moderation.

References

- Azahra, A., & Kosim, M. (2024). Peningkatan kreativitas siswa melalui implementasi Profil Pelajar Pancasila Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin (P5-PPRA) di MTSN 1 Tanah Datar. *ISLAMIKA*. Retrieved from <https://ejournal.stitpn.ac.id/index.php/islamika/article/view/5012>
- Daheri, M., Warsah, I., Morganna, R., Putri, O. A., & Adelia, P. (2023). Strengthening religious moderation: Learning from the harmony of multireligious people in Indonesia. *Journal of Population and Social Studies (JPSS)*, 31, 571–586.

- Dittmer, L. (2024). Taiwan's contested survival in an era of shrinking globalization. *Issues and Studies*, 60(1). <https://doi.org/10.1142/S1013251124500048>
- Fadil, Marwinata, P., Jannah, S., & Siroj, A. M. (2024). Religious moderation and family resilience in the city of Malang, Indonesia: The historical perspectives of the Islamic law. *Samarah*, 8(1), 236–256. <https://doi.org/10.22373/sjkh.v8i1.19821>
- Fatmawati, F. (2022). Representasi nilai pendidikan akhlak tasawuf dalam novel *Kembara Rindu* karya Habiburrahman El Shirazy. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 20(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v20i1.1211>
- Furqan, M., & Nasir, A. F. A. (2024). Big data approach to sentiment analysis in machine learning-based microblogs: Perspectives of religious moderation public policy in Indonesia. *Journal of Applied Engineering and Technological Science*, 5(2), 955–965. <https://doi.org/10.37385/jaets.v5i2.4498>
- Hadriani, N. L. G. (2020). Kearifan hukum lokal dalam mengantisipasi kekerasan atas nama agama. *Prosiding STHD Klaten Jawa Tengah*, 1(1), Article 1.
- Hanafi, Y., Saefi, M., Diyana, T. N., Ikhsan, M. A., Yani, M. T., Suciptaningsih, O. A., Anggraini, A. E., & Rufiana, I. S. (2023). What content offers and how teachers teach: Religious moderation-integrated teaching in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(2), 8. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i2.9070>
- Harahap, S. M., Siregar, F. A., & Harahap, D. (2023). Tracing the dynamic spectrum of religious moderation in the local custom of North Sumatera. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 11(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v11i1.16187>
- Hati, L. P., al-Mujtahid, N. M., Kholil, S., Sahfutra, S. A., Ginting, L. D. C. U., & Fahreza, I. (2023). Religious harmony forum: Ideal religious moderation in the frame of building tolerance in Medan City, Indonesia. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 104(4). <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.104.420>
- Helmawati, H., Marzuki, M., Hartati, R. S., & Huda, M. (2024). Islamic religious education and religious moderation at university. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 22(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v22i1.1689>
- Imron, K., & Humairoh, S. (2023). Konsepsi implementasi moderasi beragama di madrasah. *International Education Conference (IEC) FITK*, 1(1), Article 1.
- Imron, M. (2024). Implementasi program moderasi beragama dalam mewujudkan project penguatan profil pelajar Pancasila dan profil pelajar Rahmatan Lil Alamin (P5 dan PPRA) di MTS Islamiyah Kedungjambe dan MTSN 2 Kabupaten Tuban [Master's thesis, Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Sunan Giri]. <https://doi.org/10/LAMPIRAN.pdf>
- Indainanto, Y. I., Dalimunthe, M. A., Sazali, H., Rubino, & Kholil, S. (2023). Islamic communication in voicing religious moderation as an effort to prevent conflicts of differences in beliefs. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 104(4). <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.104.415>
- Iriani, D., Budiono, A., Fauzan, M., Mahfiana, L., Ningrum, E., & Masykuroh, E. (2023). Problematics of intolerance conflict between religious people in Islamic law politics

- in the digitalization era. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Social Science, Political Science, and Humanities (ICoSPOLHUM 2022)*, 1242–1250. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-118-0_141
- Jati, W., & Bachtiar, H. (2024). Redefining religious moderation education for urban Muslim youth. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 22(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v22i1.1832>
- Kholis, N., Indriharta, L., Sholeh, M., & Cardoso, L. M. O. de B. (2024). Understanding Adiwiyata school artifacts in cultivating students' characters at madrasah ibtidaiyah. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 22(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v22i1.1694>
- Kustati, M., Indra, R., Efendi, U., Ritonga, M., Nelmawarni, U., Yulia, U., & Karni, A. (2023). The effect of national insight and religious moderation on radical behavior of secondary school students. *Education Research International*, 2023, e2919611. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/2919611>
- Maarif, S. (2023). Human (relational) dignity: Perspectives of followers of indigenous religions of Indonesia. *Religions*, 14(7). <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14070848>
- Manshur, F. M., & Husni, H. (2020). Promoting religious moderation through literary-based learning: A quasi-experimental study. *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology*, 29(06), 5849–5855.
- Marpaung, W., Azizah, N., & Siregar, P. A. (2024). Islamic education, depression, religiosity, and the effects of religion moderation of Muslim students. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 80(1). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v80i1.9271>
- Muhlisin, M., Kholis, N., & Rini, J. (2023). Navigating the nexus: Government policies in cultivating religious moderation within state Islamic higher education. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 11(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v11i1.12677>
- Mulyana, R. (2023). Religious moderation in Islamic religious education textbook and implementation in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(1), 8592. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8592>
- Munir, N. P., & Anas, A. (2021). Development of the basic concept assessment of SD/MI mathematics based KKNi curriculum. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1752(1). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1752/1/012075>
- Noptario, N. (2024). Penguatan moderasi beragama di sekolah dasar dan madrasah ibtidaiyah - Studi komparatif pada program penguatan profil pelajar Pancasila (P5) dengan P5- Profil Pelajar Rahmatan Lil'alamin (PPRA) [Master's thesis, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta]. <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/64550/>
- Pajarianto, H., Pribadi, I., & Galugu, N. (2024). Moderasi beragama melalui intellectual humility perspektif kaum muda Muslim milenial. Indonesia Emas Group. <https://books.google.com/>
- Pajarianto, H., Pribadi, I., & Galugu, N. S. (2023). Youth religious moderation model and tolerance strengthening through intellectual humility. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(1), 10. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8196>

- Pranajaya, S. A., Azhar, A., Rijal, M. K., & Ramadan, W. (2022). The distinction of Merdeka curriculum in madrasah through differentiated instruction and P5-PPRA. *Sustainable Jurnal Kajian Mutu Pendidikan*, 5(2), 463–478. <https://doi.org/10.32923/kjimp.v5i2.3447>
- Priatmoko, S. (2019). The internalization of wasathiyah values in inclusion madrasah: A case study of integrated madrasah ibtida'iyah of Ar-Roihan Malang. *Al-Bidayah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam*, 11(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.14421/albidayah.v11i2.521>
- Rahman, K., & Noor, A. M. (2020). *Moderasi beragama di tengah pergumulan ideologi ekstremisme*. Universitas Brawijaya Press.
- Randy, M. Y., Kuncoro, T., & Rutfiana, I. S. (2023). Relevansi pendekatan berbasis masalah dengan penguatan profil pelajar Pancasila di sekolah dasar. *Indonesian Journal of Cyber Education*, 1(2), 102–121. <https://e-journal.syekh Nurjati.ac.id/index.php/ijce/article/view/45>
- Randy, M. Y., & Suciptaningsih, O. A. (2024). Peran profil pelajar Pancasila untuk meningkatkan etika berilmu di sekolah dasar. *EDUPEDIA*, 8(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.24269/ed.v8i1.2455>
- Rusyana, A. Y., Budiman, B., Abdillah, W. S., & Witro, D. (2023). Concepts and strategies for internalizing religious moderation values among the millennial generation in Indonesia. *Religious Inquiries*, 12(2), 157–176. <https://doi.org/10.22034/ri.2023.348511.1629>
- Saefudin, A., Munir, A. A., Novitasari, S. P., Rahmah, A., & Ummah, K. (2023). Integrasi nilai-nilai moderasi beragama ke dalam rencana pelaksanaan pembelajaran (RPP) PAI SMP kelas IX. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 21(3), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v21i3.1434>
- Sandal, N. A. (2021). Framing religious outbidding: Al-Qaida, Islamic State, and intra-religious competition. *Politics, Religion & Ideology*, 22(3–4), 461–480. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21567689.2021.1968841>
- Sial, O. (n.d.). Root mean square error (RMSE): What you need to know. Arize AI. Retrieved March 29, 2024, from <https://arize.com/blog-course/root-mean-square-error-rmse-what-you-need-to-know/>
- Subchi, I., Zulkifli, Z., Latifa, R., & Sa'diyah, S. (2022). Religious moderation in Indonesian Muslims. *Religions*, 13(5), 451. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13050451>
- Sulaiman, S., Imran, A., Hidayat, B. A., Mashuri, S., Reslawati, R., & Fakhrurrazi, F. (2022). Moderation religion in the era society 5.0 and multicultural society: Studies based on legal, religious, and social reviews. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 6(S5), 180–193. <https://doi.org/10.21744/lingcure.v6nS5.2106>
- Susilo, S., & Dalimunthe, R. P. (2019). Moderate Southeast Asian Islamic education as a parent culture in deradicalization: Urgencies, strategies, and challenges. *Religions*, 10(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel10010045>
- Susilowati, Sufanti, M., & Ma'ruf, A. I. (2023). The contents of the Pancasila student profile in the reading material of the Ministry of Education and Culture's national literacy

- movement. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Education and Literacy*, 2189–2200. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-086-2_176
- Syahbudin, Z., Ahmad, R. R. M. R., Kasmianti, K., Zein, N., & Thahir, M. (2023). Developing students' religious moderation through group counseling at Islamic higher education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 15–28. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v0i0.22977>
- Syahri, A., Yahya, S., & Saleh, A. M. A. (2024). Teaching religious moderation by Islamic education lecturers: Best practices at three Islamic universities in Mataram City. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 22(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v22i1.1737>
- Syaifudin, L. H. (2019). *Moderasi beragama* (Cetakan pertama). Badan Litbang dan Diklat, Kementerian Agama RI.
- Utami, W. B., Wedi, A., Sulthoni, & Aulia, F. (2023). Management of Merdeka curriculum towards strengthening the profile of Pancasila students in schools. In *Proceedings of the International Conference on Education and Literacy* (pp. 240–246). https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-95-4_29
- Widyana, I. K., Darsana, I. M., & Arta, I. G. A. J. (2022). Religious moderation in the framework of Bhinneka Tunggal Ika in Indonesia. In *Proceedings of the International Conference on Social Science, Political Science, and Humanities (ICoSPOLHUM 2022)* (pp. 166–169). <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.220108.029>
- Wildan, M., & Muttaqin, A. (2022). Mainstreaming moderation in preventing/countering violent extremism (P/CVE) in pesantrens in Central Java. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 10(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v10i1.8102>
- Winarsunu, T. (2017). *Statistik dalam penelitian psikologi dan pendidikan*. Malang: UMM Press.
- Yusuf, M., Alwis, A., Putra, E., Witro, D., & Nurjaman, A. (2023). The role of Anak Jalanan At-Tamur Islamic Boarding School in internalizing the values of religious moderation to college students in Bandung. *Jurnal Ilmiah Islam Futura*, 23(1), 132–156. <https://doi.org/10.22373/jiif.v23i1.15358>