



Enhancing Teacher Performance through Participatory Supervision in Indonesian Islamic Schools

Dodo Murtado^{1✉}, Cecep Soleh Kurniawan²

¹UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia, ²Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali Brunai Darussalam

ABSTRACT

Improving the quality of education in Indonesia requires a more participatory and value-based supervision approach, particularly in Islamic schools. This study aims to examine the implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya and to analyze its impact on teacher performance through theological and educational management perspectives. Employing a qualitative case study design, data were collected through in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and document analysis. The findings reveal that participatory supervision, when integrated with Islamic theological values such as *musyawarah* (deliberation), *amanah* (trustworthiness), and *ihsan* (excellence), enhances teacher involvement in the learning process and improves teaching quality. In addition, this supervision model strengthens collaborative relationships between principals and teachers, fostering responsiveness to feedback and increasing professional motivation. The study concludes that value-based participatory supervision is effective in improving teacher performance in Islamic schools. Its implications highlight the need for supervision models that prioritize not only cognitive aspects of education but also the development of character and morality, thereby supporting the broader goals of Islamic education.

ABSTRAK

Peningkatan kualitas pendidikan di Indonesia memerlukan pendekatan supervisi yang lebih partisipatif dan berbasis nilai, terutama di lingkungan madrasah. Dalam konteks ini, penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengeksplorasi penerapan supervisi partisipatif di MAN 2 Tasikmalaya dan untuk menganalisis dampaknya terhadap kinerja guru melalui pendekatan teologis dan manajerial pendidikan. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan jenis studi kasus, yang melibatkan wawancara mendalam, observasi partisipatif, dan studi dokumentasi. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa supervisi partisipatif yang terintegrasi dengan nilai-nilai teologi Islam seperti *musyawarah*, *amanah*, dan *ihsan* meningkatkan keterlibatan guru dalam proses pembelajaran dan meningkatkan kualitas pengajaran. Selain itu, supervisi ini juga memperkuat hubungan kolaboratif antara kepala madrasah dan guru, serta memotivasi guru untuk lebih responsif terhadap umpan balik. Simpulan penelitian ini menegaskan bahwa supervisi partisipatif berbasis nilai Islam efektif dalam meningkatkan kinerja guru di madrasah. Implikasi dari penelitian ini adalah pentingnya penerapan model supervisi berbasis nilai di sekolah-sekolah berbasis Islam untuk meningkatkan kualitas pembelajaran yang tidak hanya berorientasi pada aspek kognitif, tetapi juga karakter dan moralitas.

 OPEN ACCESS

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: 09-02-2025

Accepted: 31-08-2025

Keywords

Islamic Education
Supervision, Participatory
Supervision, Teacher
Performance

Kata Kunci:

Evaluasi Kinerja Guru,
Supervisi Partisipatif,
Supervisi Pendidikan Islam

Introduction

In recent years, there has been increasing attention to teacher performance as a critical determinant of educational quality across the globe. Numerous studies affirm that teacher performance directly influences student achievement, institutional reputation, and the broader goals of national education systems (Casmito et al., 2020; Rahmayanti et al., 2023). In the Indonesian Islamic school context (madrasah), performance challenges are compounded by systemic issues such as outdated supervision models, hierarchical leadership, and insufficient pedagogical development strategies (Hakim et al., 2021).

Traditional top-down supervisory systems remain the norm, characterized by limited teacher involvement in planning, evaluation, and reflective practices (Ridha et al., 2023). This rigid model contributes to a culture of compliance rather than growth, ultimately diminishing teacher motivation and performance (Zega et al., 2022). The shift toward participatory supervision, an approach rooted in collaboration, mutual respect, and shared decision-making, presents a promising alternative to improve professional accountability and growth in educational settings (Olaifa et al., 2023). Studies reveal that participatory supervision fosters a more engaged workforce, enhances trust between school leaders and staff, and leads to significant improvements in teacher competencies (Akbar, 2023).

In Islamic educational institutions, supervision is not merely an administrative task; it reflects theological and ethical principles such as *musyawarah* (consultation), *amanah* (trust), and *ihsan* (excellence) (Ferdinan et al., 2024). Yet, few studies have thoroughly explored the alignment between Islamic theological values and educational management practices in supervision. Particularly in high-performing madrasahs like MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, the implementation of participatory supervision grounded in Islamic values may hold key insights for national education reform. However, empirical documentation remains scarce (Kosman et al., 2023; Istiqomah et al., 2020).

As Islamic schools grow in number and strategic importance in Indonesia, understanding how participatory supervision can be harmonized with religious values is not only timely but essential. This study seeks to illuminate that intersection and offer contextually rooted insights from MAN 2 Tasikmalaya. Although the importance of academic supervision has been widely recognized as a strategy to improve teacher performance, supervision practices in madrasahs are still dominated by administrative approaches that are hierarchical and less participatory (Ridha et al., 2023); (Fatimah et al., 2023). In various madrasahs, supervision is still seen as a control mechanism, not as a collaborative process for teacher professional development (Hakim et al., 2021; Rohmah et al., 2023). This causes teacher involvement in the supervision process to be minimal, so that the potential for improving teacher performance is not maximized (Zega et al., 2022).

Another problem that is quite striking is the lack of integration of Islamic theological values such as *deliberation*, *ihsan*, and *trust* in managerial supervision practices. In fact, madrasahs as an Islamic-based educational institution should be able to make spiritual values the basis for a humanistic and participatory supervision approach (Ferdinan et al., 2024; Nurdiyanti et al., 2021). Unfortunately, empirical studies that explore the integration of Islamic values in the practice of madrasah supervision are still very limited (Kosman et al., 2023; Istiqomah et al., 2020). Moreover, specific case studies that explore supervision practices in leading madrasahs such as MAN 2 Tasikmalaya are still rare. Most of the research is general or quantitative, without exploring in depth the dynamics of the relationship between madrasah heads and teachers in the participatory supervision

process (Rezeki & Malli, 2024; Kurniaty & Indrayuda, 2024). The local context rich in cultural and religious values has not been widely used as a source of managerial knowledge in the development of Islamic-based supervision.

The literature gap is also seen in the lack of mapping of the concrete impact of the implementation of participatory supervision on the performance of religious teachers. In fact, the effectiveness of supervision should not only be measured by its implementation procedures, but also by the extent to which it encourages the improvement of teacher professionalism in the classroom and outside the classroom (Casmito et al., 2020; Akbar, 2023). In this context, supervision based on collaboration, dialogue, and spiritual values can be a more relevant model to be applied in the madrasah environment.

In the absence of an in-depth study on the connection between participation in supervision, Islamic values, and teacher performance in leading madrasahs such as MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, this research is very urgent. This research not only answers theoretical gaps, but also makes an applicative contribution to the development of participatory supervision practices based on Islamic values in similar madrasahs.

Various studies have highlighted the importance of principal supervision in improving teacher performance, both through academic, managerial, and clinical approaches. For example, research by (Rohmah et al., 2023) shows that academic supervision and school climate contribute significantly to teacher performance. Other studies confirm that the involvement of school principals in supervision and professional development has a direct effect on teachers' motivation and competence (Rahmayanti et al., 2023; Casmito et al., 2020). However, most of these studies still adopt conventional supervision approaches that tend to be top-down and less involve teachers in reflective and dialogical processes. In the context of Islamic education, there has not been much research that discusses the integration of Islamic values such as *ihsan*, *deliberation*, and *trust* into supervision practices. In fact, these values have strong potential in forming a pattern of more collaborative relationships between madrasah leaders and teachers (Ferdinan et al., 2024; Nurdiyanti et al., 2021).

Some studies have also begun to raise clinical and humanistic approaches in the supervision of Islamic religious education teachers, such as the clinical model based on the needs of teachers in Agam (Kurniaty & Indrayuda, 2024) dan pendekatan humanistik yang diterapkan di Pangandaran (Nurdiyanti et al., 2021). However, most of these studies are still conceptual or general, without delving into the context of specific institutions such as leading madrasahs. Furthermore, the empirical literature on participatory supervision practices, particularly in madrasah settings, is still very limited. In fact, the participatory approach has been proven to be able to increase teacher motivation, engagement, and performance in other studies in public schools and integrated Islamic schools (Akbar, 2023; Zega et al., 2022; Olaifa et al., 2023).

This research aims to fill this gap by offering a new approach that combines participatory supervision and Islamic theological values in a contextual manner. This study not only documents the actual practice in MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, but also maps the dynamics of the relationship between educational actors and their influence on the performance of religious teachers. The novelty of this research lies in the integration of spiritual values in the managerial process of education a domain that has rarely been explicitly touched on in reputable academic studies.

By making MAN 2 Tasikmalaya a case study, this research makes an empirical contribution that has not been found in many international literature. This research not only adds to the diversity of perspectives in the study of Islamic education management, but also provides an applicative model for the practice of supervision in similar madrasahs in Indonesia and other countries with value-based education systems.

This research aims to explore in depth the implementation of participatory supervision applied at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya and identify the integration of Islamic theological values such as *deliberation*, *ihsan*, and *amanah* in the process. The urgency of this research lies in the urgent need to reformulate the supervision approach in madrasahs so that it is not only oriented to administration and compliance, but also to professional development based on collaboration and spiritual values. In the context of Islamic education, this kind of approach has not been studied systematically, especially in the form of in-depth empirical case studies in leading madrasahs. The main argument in this study is that participatory supervision integrated with Islamic theological values can be a more effective strategy in improving teacher performance than conventional supervision approaches. This study assumes that teachers will be more open, actively involved, and encouraged to improve the quality of learning when the supervision process is carried out collaboratively, contextually, and based on the religious values they believe in. Using a qualitative approach of case studies, this research is expected to make a theoretical and practical contribution to the development of a madrasah supervision model based on Islamic values that is relevant to the needs of 21st-century educational institutions.

Method

This study employed a qualitative approach with a case study design, as it enabled the researcher to gain an in-depth understanding of participatory supervision within a real and specific context. Such an approach is particularly suitable when the primary objective is to explore meanings, processes, and social dynamics from the perspective of participants directly involved in the phenomenon under study (Creswell & Poth, 2018). The focus of this research was the practice of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, a leading madrasah aliyah with a distinctive religious background and organizational culture. Through the case study, the researcher was able to holistically examine the relationship between Islamic values, leadership practices, and their implications for teacher performance (Yin, 2018).

The research subjects were selected purposively, ensuring their relevance and direct knowledge of the phenomenon. Seven key informants participated: the head of MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, three teachers, and three students. The head was included due to his authority and responsibility in supervision, while the teachers represented those directly affected by supervisory practices. Students were engaged to provide complementary perspectives on changes observed in the learning process, particularly in relation to teacher performance. This selection strategy allowed the study to capture diverse viewpoints and enhance data validity through participant triangulation.

To collect rich and comprehensive data, three main techniques were applied: in-depth interviews, participatory observations, and documentation analysis. Semi-structured interviews were conducted, guided by themes such as supervisory practices, the application of Islamic theological values in leadership, and perceptions of changes in teacher performance. Observations were carried out in a participatory manner, focusing on interactions between the head and teachers, supervision sessions, and classroom dynamics. The researcher documented participation patterns, expressions of religious values, and collaborative practices. Complementary to this, documentation studies involved reviewing institutional records such as supervision schedules, minutes of teacher meetings, evaluation reports, and educational management policies.

Data collection lasted four months, from September to December 2024, and proceeded in successive stages. The initial phase involved preparation and obtaining research permits, followed by preliminary observations to understand institutional context and culture. Subsequently, interviews and detailed observations were conducted

with each informant. In the final stage, data triangulation was undertaken to cross-check and verify information from different sources, ensuring accuracy and consistency.

Data were analyzed using Miles and Huberman's (1994) interactive model, which comprises three steps: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. Reduction was conducted by selecting and simplifying data into relevant themes. The data were then displayed in thematic narratives and categorization matrices to facilitate interpretation. Finally, conclusions were drawn by identifying recurring patterns and relationships between themes, and linking them with theoretical frameworks and previous research findings. This analysis was carried out simultaneously and reflectively throughout the research process.

Ethical considerations were prioritized at all stages. Informants were fully informed about the purpose, benefits, and their rights before interviews were conducted. Informed consent was obtained both orally and in writing. Confidentiality was ensured by anonymizing identities with codes in the data presentation. Moreover, participants were given the right to withdraw at any stage without consequences. In this way, the study not only ensured scientific validity but also upheld academic ethics and respect for participants' rights.

Results and Discussion

Result

This research aims to explore the implementation of participatory supervision applied at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya and identify Islamic theological values that are integrated in the process. All data presented in this section were obtained through in-depth interviews, field observations, and documentation studies, and were analyzed thematically according to the focus of the research objectives.

The Implementation of Participatory Supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya

The implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya has evolved from a traditional administrative process into a leadership culture that emphasizes dialogue, collaboration, and shared development. The head of the madrasah emphasized that supervision is not just control, but a shared learning experience where teachers participate in planning, evaluating, and reflecting together. This collaborative approach is highlighted in interviews where teachers felt actively involved in the process, such as offering input on supervision mechanisms and being part of reflective evaluations.

Direct classroom observations and post-learning reflections revealed a welcoming and open atmosphere during supervision. The head of the madrasah adopts an empathetic and dialogical approach rather than an authoritative one, encouraging teachers to reflect on their teaching methods and make improvements together. This approach helps foster a sense of shared responsibility between teachers and the head of the madrasah. In official documents like the Semester Supervision Plan and the Teacher Quality Guidebook, the focus on reflection, innovation, and professional learning underscores the integration of values with pedagogical goals. One unique practice is the peer observation program, which allows teachers to observe and learn from each other's teaching methods. Teachers are free to choose their observation partners, and after the observation, they engage in joint reflection to discuss the methods and results.

Teachers are also actively involved in the internal Subject Teacher Deliberation (MGMP) forum, where they evaluate the curriculum and teaching strategies. The head of the madrasah facilitates these discussions, encouraging teachers to voice their opinions and suggest improvements, which sometimes leads to changes in supervision policies. This illustrates how participatory supervision extends beyond technical practices and becomes an integral part of the madrasah's decision-making culture. Additionally, the

supervision system is sustained through internal policies, such as a mentor rotation schedule where senior teachers guide newer teachers in lesson planning and teaching methods. This mutualistic approach strengthens the relationship between teachers, making the supervision process more collaborative. Furthermore, students are informally involved in the reflection process, with teachers often seeking their feedback on lessons. This contributes to a more democratic and responsive learning environment. The integration of Islamic values in reflections, such as the concept of trust in teaching, reinforces the professional ethics framework within the supervision system.

In conclusion, participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya is characterized by active teacher involvement, horizontal relationships between the head of the madrasah and teachers, and the integration of Islamic values. These elements create a transformative supervisory system that not only improves the quality of learning but also nurtures a reflective and spiritually enriched school environment.

Islamic Theological Values in Participatory Supervision

The implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya is deeply rooted in Islamic theological values that have been internalized into the organizational culture and leadership practices. Values such as deliberation (*shura*), trust, *ihsan*, and sincerity are not merely symbolic, but are actively integrated into the supervision process, influencing how the madrasah head builds relationships, conveys feedback, and encourages the professional development of teachers. The practice of *shura* is central in decision-making, as the head of the madrasah views supervision as a collaborative dialogue rather than a top-down control tool. Teachers are actively involved in reflection and planning, fostering an atmosphere of mutual trust and democracy.

The value of trust (*amanah*) is another integral component of the supervision model, emphasizing moral and spiritual responsibility in the teaching profession. The madrasah head views education as a trust from Allah SWT and approaches feedback with the mindset of mutual responsibility, not as a means of punishment. This value is reflected in official documents, such as the Value-Based Teacher Supervision Guide, where supervision is framed as a shared responsibility rather than a purely technical or repressive exercise. This approach enhances communication, fostering a motivational and humanized culture within the madrasah.

Ihsan, or doing one's best for the sake of Allah, is another prominent value in the supervisory interactions. During classroom observations, feedback is often framed within the context of spiritual growth, as the madrasah head encourages teachers to improve their work as a form of worship. Teachers' report feeling more motivated and open to receiving feedback because they perceive it as an opportunity for personal and spiritual development rather than merely technical correction. This approach has helped to shift teachers' perspectives on supervision, making it a reflective and growth-oriented process.

Sincerity (*ikhlas*) also plays a significant role in the supervision process, with teachers noting that supervision has become a time for personal reflection and spiritual purification. Teachers no longer see supervision as an administrative burden but as an opportunity for self-improvement and alignment with their professional and spiritual goals. Some even engage in self-reflection independently outside of formal supervision, indicating a deeper internalization of these values.

Finally, the integration of Islamic values is further evident in the New Teacher Training Module, which includes specific guidance on applying values such as *shura*, *ihsan*, and *amanah* in teaching practices. The documentation study revealed that these values are not only present in verbal feedback but are institutionalized through practical guidance and religious references, such as hadiths and Qur'anic verses, reinforcing the spiritual dimension of professional development. This comprehensive integration of

Islamic values transforms supervision into a holistic, supportive, and spiritually enriching process for both teachers and the madrasah community.

The Role of Madrasah Principal and Teachers in Supervision Relations

The participatory supervision practices at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya are built on a strong dialogical relationship between the madrasah head and the teachers, which emphasizes equality and collaboration. This relationship is not structured solely on formal authority but on the recognition of teachers' professionalism and the belief that education improvement can only be achieved through mutual cooperation. The madrasah head views himself as a learning partner rather than an assessor. He emphasizes that his role is to work alongside teachers in a collaborative learning process, not merely to supervise. Teachers affirmed this, describing the madrasah head as someone who listens first and engages them in problem-solving discussions, creating an open environment for feedback.

This collaborative and egalitarian approach was further observed during classroom supervision and reflection sessions. During these sessions, the madrasah head actively listens to teachers' experiences, asking questions like, "What did you feel when you taught earlier?" This approach fosters a shared learning space where teachers feel empowered to reflect and improve, rather than feeling judged. This interaction exemplifies transformational leadership, where the leader not only provides guidance but also inspires and creates an environment that supports growth, empowering teachers to develop independently.

Moreover, the relationship between the madrasah head and teachers is supported by formal policies that promote cooperation and mentoring. The Internal Supervision Guidelines emphasize that supervision should be seen as cooperation and coaching, not mere evaluation. Teachers are also assigned mentors based on mutual agreement, further reflecting the autonomy and professional respect given to teachers. These practices demonstrate that supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya is rooted in a culture of respect, trust, and collective responsibility, rather than a hierarchical structure.

The madrasah principal also fosters informal relationships to maintain closeness with teachers. Teachers shared that he often joins them for lunch, attends family events, and is available for consultations at any time. These practices help build respect and rapport, which are not solely based on position but on genuine care and presence. Additionally, the spiritual dimension of the supervision process is evident, as the madrasah head frequently connects the work with Islamic values such as *ukhuwah* (brotherhood) and trust. These values not only enhance the emotional bonds among staff but also deepen the meaning of their professional duties.

Lastly, the trust and open communication fostered in this environment have led to greater teacher participation in professional development forums. In internal MGMP meetings, teachers actively share ideas, propose new methods, and even lead discussions. This indicates a shift from traditional supervision to a collaborative culture where teachers feel ownership of the supervision process. Teachers now approach supervision as a collective responsibility, contributing to a sense of community and shared success. This transformation highlights how participatory supervision, built on trust and mutual respect, can break down psychological barriers and foster a healthy, supportive work environment.

The Impact of Participatory Supervision on Teacher Performance

The implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya has significantly improved teacher performance, not just in terms of administrative tasks, but also in motivation, professionalism, and engagement in self-development. Teachers

expressed feeling appreciated and supported in the process, with one stating, "I used to feel apprehensive when I was supervised. Now I look forward to it because it's a constructive moment of discussion." The open, dialogical supervision approach has led to increased intrinsic motivation, making teachers more open to feedback, trying new methods, and actively developing their competencies.

This increase in motivation is also reflected in teachers' classroom activities. Teachers have become more creative, using student-centered methods such as group discussions, presentations, and educational games. They actively engage students by asking open-ended questions and providing constructive responses. This shift indicates that teachers feel more comfortable and confident in their teaching, thanks to the non-repressive atmosphere fostered by participatory supervision. Moreover, the participatory supervision approach has encouraged teachers to become more reflective about their teaching practices. One teacher shared, "We were asked to make a reflection after teaching. It helps me not to teach in the same way over and over again." This reflective practice has become an essential tool for teachers' professional growth and self-improvement, helping them identify areas for development and fostering a culture of continuous learning.

The impact of participatory supervision is also evident in the documentation, with performance evaluation reports showing improvements in classroom management, use of learning media, and material delivery. The head of the madrasah also noted an increase in creativity in learning strategies and student involvement. This indicates that participatory supervision has contributed directly to better classroom teaching quality and teachers' professional attitudes, encouraging active participation in internal MGMP forums and involvement in the development of madrasah learning policies.

Finally, the integration of Islamic values such as *amanah*, *ihsan*, and *ikhlas* in supervision has strengthened teachers' spiritual motivation. Teachers reported feeling more connected to their work when they viewed teaching as a trust from God, rather than just an obligation. However, challenges such as limited time for supervision and some teachers' passivity in the reflection process remain. The head of the madrasah is addressing these issues by developing internal training and enhancing the role of peer mentors. Overall, participatory supervision has created a shift in perspective, transforming supervision into a shared learning space that promotes professional awareness, competence, and integrity.

Challenges and Opportunities in the Implementation of Participatory Supervision

The implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya has brought positive impacts on teacher performance and the learning climate. However, the study also highlights several challenges that need to be addressed for continuous improvement. The first challenge is the time constraints and heavy workload of the madrasah head. Balancing administrative tasks, communication with the office, and supervision duties makes it difficult to provide equal assistance to all teachers. The head of the madrasah expressed the difficulty of providing regular supervision to every teacher due to a tight schedule, which affects the consistency of supervision.

The second challenge is the variability in teachers' readiness to actively participate. Participatory supervision requires teachers to be reflective partners, giving and receiving feedback. However, some teachers, accustomed to traditional top-down supervision, struggle with this new approach. A teacher mentioned feeling uncertain about how to contribute to long reflective discussions, indicating the need for a culture shift toward reflective practices, which cannot happen overnight. The third challenge is the need for continuous training. Both teachers and madrasah heads acknowledge the importance of training on supervision based on Islamic values and a collaborative approach. Currently,

the supervision modules used are still generic and not tailored to integrate participatory supervision with theological principles, which limits its full effectiveness.

On the other hand, the study found several opportunities that could strengthen participatory supervision in the future. First, there is strong support from the madrasah community, including teachers, staff, and students, which creates a conducive atmosphere for collaborative learning and supervision. The head of the madrasah enjoys strong moral legitimacy, fostering a positive environment for developing meaningful supervision. Another opportunity is the flexible institutional structure, which allows for innovations in supervision without many bureaucratic barriers. This flexibility enables the implementation of peer supervision, collective reflection forums, and value-based evaluation instruments. Additionally, the potential for digitizing supervision through online platforms could offset the time limitations of face-to-face sessions, making supervision more adaptive to the digital era while maintaining its participatory and spiritual essence.

Furthermore, the development of a madrasah-specific supervision model based on Islamic values presents a strategic opportunity. MAN 2 Tasikmalaya's reflective and spiritually grounded approach could serve as a model for other institutions, creating supervision models that are academically relevant and aligned with the traditions of Indonesian Islamic education. Collaboration with the Ministry of Religious Affairs and other training institutions could further strengthen the capacity of madrasah heads and teachers in value-based supervision, creating a sustainable professional development ecosystem.

Discussion

Integration of Theological Values in Supervisory Practice

The implementation of participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya integrates Islamic theological values, transforming the supervision process into a holistic practice that encompasses spiritual and professional development. These values, including *shura* (deliberation), *amanah* (trust), *ihsan* (excellence), and *uswah hasanah* (exemplary conduct), are deeply embedded in communication, decision-making, and the relationship between the madrasah head and teachers. The principle of *shura* is evident as the madrasah head involves teachers in discussions about supervision goals, observation methods, and development indicators, reflecting the Islamic teaching of collective decision-making (QS. Ash-Shura: 38).

Amanah, or trust, also plays a key role in participatory supervision. The madrasah head does not act solely as an evaluator, but as a responsible partner in teachers' professional development. After class observations, the madrasah head works closely with teachers to create improvement plans, reinforcing the moral and spiritual responsibility that comes with teaching. This approach is consistent with Jumiati et al. (2024), which highlights how Islamic value-based supervision fosters ethical awareness and collective responsibility.

Ihsan, or excellence in work, is another core value that distinguishes this participatory approach from top-down models. Teachers in MAN 2 Tasikmalaya reported that the feedback provided by the madrasah head was constructive, empathetic, and aimed at improvement. This practice of offering feedback in a personal and respectful manner encourages teachers to grow willingly, not out of obligation. Ferdinan et al. (2024) emphasize the importance of *ihsan* in supervision to create a harmonious work environment where teachers feel motivated to improve.

Uswah hasanah, or exemplary conduct, is evident in the madrasah head's consistent demonstration of discipline, perseverance, and a passion for learning. Teachers observe and follow the madrasah head's approach to training, giving feedback, and maintaining

order. This model of leadership has been shown to strengthen intrinsic motivation among teachers, as highlighted by Pewangi et al. (2024), and fosters a culture of respect and continuous improvement.

The integration of these theological values into supervision aligns with Islamic transformational leadership, where the leader not only directs tasks but also provides spiritual guidance. Ridwan et al. (2024) argue that modern Islamic education requires leaders who integrate managerial strategies with theocentric approaches, turning supervision into a means of spiritual purification (*tazkiyatun nafs*) and professional development. Furthermore, the spiritual dimension of supervision at MAN 2, including group prayers and brief religious talks, underscores that teacher development is seen not only as a professional task but as a collective act of worship, as supported by Muhlis et al. (2023). This approach strengthens teachers' moral commitment to their duties, making participatory supervision an authentic and spiritually enriching process.

Dynamics of the Relationship between Madrasah Heads and Teachers in Participatory Supervision

One of the key findings of this study is the strong dialogical relationship between the madrasah head and teachers in participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya. Unlike conventional top-down approaches, this relationship is characterized by open communication, mutual trust, and recognition of teachers' professionalism. The madrasah head serves as a facilitator and equal partner, creating a shift from hierarchical supervision to a more humanistic and collaborative model. This aligns with Zega et al. (2022), who highlight the positive impact of participatory leadership in fostering a collaborative and productive work environment.

The participatory leadership style is further evident in the active involvement of teachers in supervision planning, decision-making, and reflective evaluations. Informal interactions, such as discussions in the teachers' lounge and after-school meetings, play a crucial role in strengthening horizontal relationships. This reflects the values of *ukhuwah* (brotherhood) and *shura* (deliberation) deeply embedded in the madrasah culture, as supported by Suyono et al. (2022), who assert that warm interpersonal relationships foster openness to supervision. Teachers reported feeling more valued and involved in decision-making processes. One teacher shared, "We don't feel monitored negatively; we feel guided and listened to," reflecting the success of the madrasah head in building empathetic, egalitarian relationships. This aligns with Mbua (2023), who argues that the effectiveness of participatory leadership depends on trust and active participation in teacher-head relationships.

Additionally, the madrasah head demonstrates sensitivity to individual teacher needs, adjusting the supervisory approach based on experience and teaching style. This personalized supervision aligns with Akbar's (2023) concept of differentiated supervision, highlighting the importance of mapping teacher characteristics to tailor support effectively. The madrasah head not only directs but also adapts to the dynamic and diverse needs of teachers.

However, establishing these relationships was not instantaneous. Resistance from some teachers accustomed to formal, administrative supervision was initially a challenge. Yet, through persuasive approaches and the example set by the madrasah head, these obstacles were gradually overcome. This process is supported by Nurhayati et al. (2019), who emphasize the importance of leadership as a role model in fostering a collaborative work culture in Islamic schools. Overall, the participatory supervision model at MAN 2 demonstrates that professional relationships built on dialogue, mutual understanding, and emotional engagement can create a spiritually and culturally aligned management approach.

The Impact of Supervision on Teacher Performance

The findings of this study consistently show that participatory supervision, implemented collaboratively and based on Islamic theological values, has a significant impact on improving teacher performance at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya. This approach allows teachers to feel valued, heard, and actively engaged in the evaluation and self-development process. Teachers are not seen merely as objects of supervision, but as active subjects in the effort to enhance professionalism, which leads to increased work motivation, better teaching quality, and improved work discipline among the teachers involved in the study.

One clear indicator of this positive impact is the increased awareness among teachers regarding the importance of well-planned and reflective lesson preparation. Teachers have begun to integrate feedback from supervision into their teaching materials, create more varied assessments, and show improvement in their teaching methods. This finding aligns with Hakim et al. (2021), who state that participatory academic supervision significantly affects teacher performance, especially in enhancing the quality of the learning process.

Furthermore, participatory supervision strengthens the climate of trust and openness between teachers and the madrasah head. Based on values such as *amanah* (trust) and *shura* (deliberation), teachers have become more receptive to feedback, viewing criticism as a tool for self-improvement. Nurdyanti et al. (2021) emphasize the importance of a humanistic approach in supervision to encourage significant improvements in teacher performance, which is evident in the findings. The participatory supervision approach identified in this study reflects what is theorized as “collaborative supervision,” where the interaction between the supervisor and teachers is dialogical, reflective, and supports continuous professional development (Sergiovanni, 2009; Cogan, 1973).

The study also reveals that the improvement in performance is not limited to technical aspects but also extends to spiritual and ethical work. Teachers feel that their involvement in a spiritually enriched supervision process makes them more sincere, professional, and responsible for their duties. Supervision is no longer merely an administrative control, but a means of moral and ethical development. This aligns with Ferdinan et al. (2024), who highlight the positive effects of values such as *ihsan* (excellence), sincerity, and exemplary conduct in supervision on teacher professionalism.

From a managerial perspective, the structured and scheduled supervision process also creates accountability in teachers' duties. The madrasah head provides space for teachers to present their progress post-supervision, encouraging a performance-based work culture. Zega et al. (2022) emphasize the crucial role of participatory leadership in enhancing teacher performance through collegial supervision. However, the effectiveness of participatory supervision heavily relies on the madrasah head's competence and the teachers' willingness to actively participate, as highlighted by Rahmayanti et al. (2023). Overall, participatory supervision has proven to improve teachers' pedagogical, professional, social, and spiritual dimensions, making it a suitable model for madrasahs that value religious principles and collectivity.

New Theories and Modifications of Supervisory Approaches

This study introduces a new model of participatory supervision based on Islamic theological values, called Islamic Value-Based Participatory Supervision (IVBPS). IVBPS goes beyond traditional supervisory approaches by integrating spiritual values such as *shura* (deliberation), *amanah* (trust), and *ihsan* (excellence), shaping the interaction between the madrasah head and teachers. The model represents a synthesis of

humanistic and structural approaches, expanding on clinical supervision theory by incorporating the spiritual dimension of teachers. The madrasah head serves as a *murabbi* (spiritual guide) rather than just an administrator, fostering a dialogical and empathetic relationship with teachers (Khairullah, 2020; Prasetia et al., 2022).

The application of IVBPS reflects key educational theories, such as John Dewey's progressivism, which emphasizes democratic and participatory learning experiences. However, IVBPS adapts this approach through an Islamic lens, incorporating awareness of spiritual responsibility and the importance of exemplary conduct (*uswah hasanah*). This model not only focuses on pedagogical and reflective participation but also emphasizes the ethical and spiritual duties of teachers, ensuring that supervision aligns with both professional and moral values.

One significant contribution of IVBPS is its alignment with participatory alignment, where expectations and behaviors in the supervisory relationship are mutually understood and respected (Aitken et al., 2020). In the context of Islamic education, this alignment is further enriched by religious values, fostering not only professional relationships but also moral bonds based on *ukhuwah* (brotherhood) and integrity. Walid et al. (2024) support this by highlighting the importance of inclusive leadership in multicultural Islamic institutions.

The findings also reveal that Islamic theological values are not merely normative, but actively shape the work culture and relationships between teachers and the madrasah head. This aligns with Pewangi et al. (2024), who highlight the role of four pillars of Islamic values, namely *ihsan*, sincerity, exemplary conduct, and renewal, in academic supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya, these values are reflected in practices such as collaborative lesson planning, fairness and patience in providing feedback, and the madrasah head's leadership by example. This supports the concept of Prophetic Leadership (Khaironi, 2021), which integrates ethical, transcendental, and operational dimensions in Islamic educational leadership.

The theoretical foundation of participatory supervision also resonates with the ideas of Glatthorn (1997), who suggests that successful supervision combines evaluative elements with an empathetic, developmental approach. The findings of this study confirm that a humanistic approach to supervision, as seen in Islamic schools, fosters cooperation and professional development (Nurdiyanti et al., 2021). Moreover, the study supports the theory of systemic management in education, which stresses the synergy between organizational structure, work culture, and normative values (Bush, 2011; Hoy & Miskel, 2008), emphasizing that participatory supervision can be a strategy for institutional development.

The study also highlights the relevance of Distributed Leadership theory (Spillane, 2006), as teachers at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya actively engage in the supervision process. This collaborative approach creates a sense of collective responsibility for improving quality, rather than a top-down supervisory control. The positive correlation between participatory supervision and improved teacher performance, seen in planning, execution, and evaluation of lessons, affirms Barkah et al. (2021), who found that school leadership significantly influences teacher performance.

Finally, this study contributes to the adaptation of supervisory models in religious-based institutions. The findings indicate that supervision in Islamic schools must align spiritual values with professionalism, and that participatory supervision should be adaptable to local cultural and institutional contexts. This supports the educational change theory (Fullan, 2007), which posits that effective change in supervision practices requires not only systemic shifts but also changes in culture and values. The integration of Islamic values into participatory supervision represents a paradigm shift from control

to spiritual and professional development, offering a more contextual, value-based, and transformative approach to supervision.

Conclusion

This study concludes that participatory supervision at MAN 2 Tasikmalaya is an effective strategy for improving teacher performance across professional, spiritual, and collaborative dimensions. The supervision model employed was not limited to technical or administrative functions but incorporated Islamic theological values such as *shura* (deliberation), *amanah* (trust), and *ihsan* (excellence) as guiding principles in teacher development. The madrasah head served not only as an administrator but also as a facilitator and moral role model, fostering dialogical and trusting relationships with teachers. This approach created a conducive environment that encouraged reflection, innovation, and professional growth. The findings demonstrate that participatory supervision addresses both institutional requirements and the spiritual-emotional needs of teachers as key figures in education.

Key findings revealed that, first, supervision was characterized by collective reflection, reinforcement-oriented classroom observation, and structured deliberation forums. Second, Islamic theological values provided the ethical and normative foundations for supervisory practices and teacher assessment. Third, supervision was conducted on a horizontal basis, positioning teachers as active partners rather than passive objects. Fourth, the model enhanced pedagogical quality while simultaneously boosting teachers' motivation and confidence. Fifth, challenges included limited supervisory time, cultural resistance, and the absence of systematic training in value-based supervision.

The implications of this study are both theoretical and practical. Theoretically, it contributes to the development of an Islamic value-based supervision model by integrating elements of Transformational and Humanistic Supervision with prophetic values, resulting in what can be conceptualized as prophetic-participatory supervision. This approach can serve as a prototype for other madrasahs and faith-based institutions. Practically, the findings provide strategic insights for madrasah heads, supervisors, and policymakers in designing supervisory systems that balance administrative accountability with spiritual and ethical growth. Training programs on value-based supervision, as well as more flexible regulatory frameworks, are recommended to support wider adoption.

Despite these contributions, this research has limitations. It focused on a single madrasah with a small pool of informants, which restricts the generalizability of the findings. Future studies should replicate and expand the research in different contexts—across regions, educational levels, and institutional types (e.g., MTs and pesantren). Comparative and multi-site case studies could deepen understanding, while quantitative or mixed-methods approaches would allow measurement of the statistical relationship between participatory supervision and teacher performance outcomes.

In sum, this study highlights that supervision in Islamic schools should not only measure performance but also nurture the spiritual integrity and reflective capacities of teachers. By embedding Islamic theological values within participatory supervision, madrasahs can create more humanistic, empowering, and sustainable systems of teacher development. This redefined approach strengthens the dual mission of madrasahs: to educate intellectually competent graduates while nurturing moral and spiritual character aligned with Islamic values.

References

- Aitken, G., Smith, K., Fawns, T., & Jones, D. (2020). Participatory alignment: A positive relationship between educators and students during online master dissertation supervision. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 27(5), 772–786.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2020.1744129>
- Akbar, I. A. (2023). Principal participatory leadership style, organizational culture, teacher achievement motivation. *EAJ (Economic and Accounting Journal)*, 6(2), 131–140.
<https://doi.org/10.32493/eaj.v6i2.y2023.p131-140>
- Anggraeni, R., & Muhaemin, A. (2025). *Prophetic Leadership in Islamic Schools*. *International Journal of Asian Education*. <https://doi.org/10.46966/ijae.v6i1.476>
- Assalihee, M., Bakoh, N., Boonsuk, Y., & Songmuang, J. (2024). Transforming Islamic Education through Lesson Study (LS): A Classroom-Based Approach to Professional Development in Southern Thailand. *Education Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci14091029>.
- Barkah, J., Hidayat, F., & Nurbaity, N. (2021). *Principal Supervision Effect on Primary School Teacher Performance*. *INTELEKTUUM*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.37010/int.v2i1.359>
- Casmito., Rifai, R., & Harlanu, M. (2020). The Effect of Academic Supervision and Teacher Participation in Subject Teacher's Meeting on Improving Teacher Performance of Islamic Junior High School. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Science and Education and Technology (ISET 2019)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200620.028>.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Efendy, R., Karim, A., Amri, A. M., & Rahman, H. (2023). Konstruksi Model Pembelajaran Berbasis Partisipatif pada Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di SMAN 1 Parepare. *Jurnal Al-Qalam*, 15(1). <https://doi.org/10.47435/al-qalam.v15i1.1383>
- Fatimah, M., M., Putra, R., Muhammad, M., Zinah, A., & Masuwd, M. (2023). Optimization of The Principal's Role As A Supervisor to Improve The Performance of Teachers In Surakarta. *Profetika: Jurnal Studi Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.23917/profetika.v24i02.1986>.
- Ferdinan, F., Sumiati, H., & Mumtahanah, M. (2024). Integration of Islamic values in the supervision of school principal education in improving teacher performance in Madrasah Aliyah Muhammadiyah Datarang. *Asian Journal of Social and Humanities*, 2(4).
<https://doi.org/10.59888/ajosh.v2i4.221>
- Fullan, M. (2007). *The New Meaning of Educational Change* (4th ed.). Routledge.
- Glatthorn, A. A. (1997). *Differentiated Supervision*. ASCD.
- Glickman, C. D., Gordon, S. P., & Ross-Gordon, J. M. (2017). *SuperVision and Instructional Leadership: A Developmental Approach* (10th ed.). Pearson.
- Hakim, S., Sowiyah, S., Fitriyanti, Z., & Perdana, R. (2021). The Effect of Academic Supervision in Improving Teacher Performance: A Literature Review. *International Conference Proceedings..* <https://doi.org/10.4108/EAI.16-10-2020.2305197>.
- Hoy, W. K., & Miskel, C. G. (2008). *Educational Administration: Theory, Research, and Practice* (8th ed.). McGraw-Hill.
- Istiqomah, I., Nurdyansyah, N., Fahyuni, E. F., & Anshori, I. (2020). Analysis of supervision results of teacher's performance in developing quality of Islamic education institutions. *Proceedings of The ICECRS*. <https://doi.org/10.21070/icecrs2020382>.

- Jumiati, J., Mulyani, S., Yanto, R., Imron, I., Anasrul, M., Harto, K., & Astuti, M. (2024). Analysis of the Islamic Concept of Supervision. *TOFEDU: The Future of Education Journal*, 3(5). <https://doi.org/10.61445/tofedu.v3i5.317>
- Khaironi, K. (2021). Kepemimpinan Profetik dalam Pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Edukasi*, 9(1), 65–76.
- Khairullah. (2020). Supervisi Akademik Berbasis Nilai-nilai Islami pada Sekolah Dasar Model Kota Banda Aceh (Suatu Analisis Humanisme Teosentris). *Tanzir*, 11(1), 82–112. <https://doi.org/10.47498/tanzir.v11i1.353>
- Kosman, K., Djubaedi, D., Sumarna, C., & Rosidin, D. (2023). Implementation of Supervisors as Agents of Change in Islamic Education in Indonesia (Case Study of Islamic Religious Education Supervisors in Kuningan Regency). *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Analysis*. <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijmra/v6-i6-31>.
- Kurniaty, R., & Indrayuda, I. (2024). Clinical Supervision Model: Efforts to Improve the Performance of Islamic Religious Education Teachers in Indonesia. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 16(4). <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v16i4.5836>
- Masnawati, E., Bafadal, I., Imron, A., & Supriyanto, A. (2019). Teachers' Professional Development Coaching Based on Islamic Boarding School Culture. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*. <https://doi.org/10.13189/UJER.2019.070909>.
- Mbua, E. M. (2023). Principal's participatory leadership approaches: An effective tool for teacher effectiveness in Fako Division, Cameroon. *Journal of Education and Teaching Methods*, 2(1), 12–23. <https://doi.org/10.58425/jetm.v2i1.133>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Muhlis, M., Yusuf, M., & Kaharuddin, K. (2023). Islamic Education 4.0: Integration of Moral Education Values in the Learning Process. *At-Tarbawi: Jurnal Kajian Kependidikan Islam*, 7(2). <https://doi.org/10.22515/attarbawi.v7i2.5144>
- Mustofa, M., Ahmadi, R., & Karimullah, I. W. (2020). Islamic Character Education in E-Learning Model: How Should It be Implemented? *JSSH*, 4(1), 89–93. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jssh.v4i1.9771>
- Nurdiyanti, Y., Arifin, Z., Ridwan, W., Suhada, D., & Erihadiana, M. (2021). Humanistic Approach in Supervision and Evaluation of Islamic Religious Education. *Nidhomul Haq*, 6(3), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v6i3.1753>
- Nurhayati, T., Masnun, M., Udin, T., & Arifuddin, A. (2019). Implementation of principal supervision as an effort to fulfill teacher administration at Islamic elementary school. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 7(8), 1789–1795. <https://doi.org/10.13189/UJER.2019.070822>
- Olaifa, A., Adeoye, M., Olaifa, E., & Oshin, O. (2023). Participatory Decision-Making and Teacher's Job Performance in Public Secondary Schools. *Bisma: The Journal of Counseling*. <https://doi.org/10.23887/bisma.v7i3.71692>.
- Pewangi, M., Ferdinan, F., & Jarong, K. (2024). Integration of Islamic Values in the Implementation of Academic Supervision. *Lentera Pendidikan*, 27(2). <https://doi.org/10.24252/lp.2024v27n2i13>
- Praselia, I., Akrim, A., & Sulasmi, E. (2022). Developing Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Which Accentuates Listening and Responding Skills. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v14i1.1299>
- Rahmat, A., & Nasir, M. (2023). Supervisi Kolaboratif Berbasis Nilai Islam dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Guru Madrasah. *Jurnal Edukasi*, 21(2). <https://jurnaledukasi.kemenag.go.id/>

- Rahmayanti, D., Matin, M., & Rahmawati, D. (2023). The Impact of Academic Supervision and Professional Competence on the Performance of Teachers of Private Islamic Junior High School Teachers In West Jakarta. *EDUTECH: Journal of Education and Technology*. <https://doi.org/10.29062/edu.v7i2.806>.
- Rezeki, S., Malli, R., Bakri, M., & Sumiati, S. (2024). Implementation of the Supervisory Function in Improving Teacher Competence at Madrasah Aliyah Modern Pesantren IMMIM Putera Makassar. *Fikrotuna: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Manajemen Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.32806/jf.v13i1.795>.
- Ridha, A., Junaidi, J., Yakub, A., Harbes, B., & Huida, T. (2023). The Effect of Principal Supervision on Teacher Performance at Prof Dr Hamka Maninjau Islamic Boarding School. *GIC Proceeding*. <https://doi.org/10.30983/gic.v1i1.137>.
- Ridwan, M., Ubaidillah, A., & Maryati, S. (2024). Reactualization of Islamic Theology in Education. *Edusoshum: Journal of Islamic Education and Social Humanities*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.52366/edusoshum.v4i1.95>
- Sahudi, S., & Ma'arif, S. (2024). Collaborative Supervision: Increasing Teachers' Creativity in the Implementation of Multicultural-based Independent Curriculum. *Dinamika Ilmu*, 24(1), 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.21093/di.v24i1.8155>
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (2009). *The Principalship: A Reflective Practice Perspective*. Pearson.
- Spillane, J. P. (2006). *Distributed Leadership*. Jossey-Bass.
- Sukandi, V. D., Qomariyah, S., Ruslandi, U., Rizkiyana, A., & Institut Madani. (2025). Peran Supervisi Pendidikan Berbasis Nilai Islam. *Katalis Pendidikan: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan dan Matematika*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.62383/katalis.v2i1.1235>
- Sulaeman, A. (2023). Supervisi Pendidikan Berbasis Akhlak dan Spiritual. *Jurnal Edukasi Kemenag RI*, 7(1). <https://jurnaledukasi.kemenag.go.id>
- Suyono, S., Fahyuni, E. F., & Haryanto, B. (2022). The role of principal's participatory leadership in increasing creativity among Islamic religious education teachers. *KnE Social Sciences*, 7(10), 145–158. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v7i10.11262>
- Tailah, T. (2017). Principal supervision approach in the development of teacher professionalism to Integrated Islamic Education Institutions (Case Study on SDIT Al-Khair Barabai). *Thesis*, UIN Antasari Banjarmasin.
- Walid, A., Hidayati, S., & Ramli, N. (2024). Cultural Synergy in Islamic Educational Leadership: Developing an Inclusive Model for Enhancing Management Effectiveness and Educational Quality in Culturally Diverse Institutions. *JUMPA*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.33650/jumpa.v5i1.9335>
- Wulandari, N. (2019). Competencies principal of the Islamic school. *International Conference of Moslem Society*, 3, 88–95. <https://doi.org/10.24090/icms.2019.2430>
- Wulandari, T. (2020). Teori Progresivisme John Dewey dan Pendidikan Partisipatif dalam Pendidikan Islam. *At-Tarbawi*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.22515/attarbawi.v5i1.2221>
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Zega, N., Sitanggang, N., & N. (2022). Principal Participatory Leadership Management in Improving Teacher Performance. *JPI (Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia)*. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpiundiksha.v11i4.53671>.